

Recommendations on Laws Relating to Sexual Assault in India

SUBMISSION TO THE JUSTICE VERMA COMMITTEE

National Network of Sex Workers [NNSW] India, 5 January 2013

PREAMBLE

- We, members of the National Network of Sex Workers [NNSW] based in Andhra Pradesh, Maharashtra, Karnataka, Kerala and Tamil Nadu are sex workers' organizations and sex work support organizations committed to advocate for the rights of people in sex work including women, persons who identify as women and transgender women.
- The objective of this network is to give voice to sex workers issues and be heard across the country. Although sex work per se is not illegal in our country, sex workers are often abused and harassed by law enforcing agencies and private parties.

SUBMISSION

- 1. International and National commitments call on States to exercise "due diligence in preventing, investigating and punishing acts of violence against women" and providing women "access to mechanisms of justice" and due redress in accordance with national legislations.¹² The Hon'ble Supreme Court of India has upheld the rights of women in sex work observing that Article 21 grants them a right to *live with dignity*³. Despite these commitments, people in sex work continue to be stigmatized, discriminated and denied access to their rights. Violence against people in sex work denies them the fundamental right to life and dignity.
- 2. Violence and sexual assault is linked to the perception of sex workers as not being 'normal citizens' and has led to routine and large scale violations of human and fundamental rights like right to life, equality, equal protection of laws and due process under law. Stigmatization of sex workers permeates the criminal-justice machinery across India resulting in a lack of protection under the law.
- 3. Sexual Violence within sex work
 - 3.1 The incidence of rape of sex workers (women, persons who identify as women and transgender women in sex work) is high with little social or legal recognition. Myths surrounding the violence of rape against sex workers ensure that they are constantly on the fringes of access and redress to justice. These myths include 'A sex worker cannot be raped" (If she has consented to multiple partners or commercial sex, she

¹ Declaration on Elimination of Violence Against Women, 1993, UN General Assembly

²The Political Declaration made by States at the UN General Assembly further commit to strengthening 'legal, policy, administrative and other measures for the promotion and protection of women's full enjoyment of human rights' and the 'elimination of all forms of discrimination including violence against women'. The Declaration also calls on States to protect the rights of specific vulnerable populations and ensure an environment that strengthens efforts against stigma and discrimination. ³ Budhadev Karmaskar v State of Bengal, Cr Ap No. 135 of 2012



has given up the right to refuse other partners or other acts); 'No harm is done'; 'They deserve to be raped'; 'All sex workers are the same'.⁴

Though Criminal law makes no distinction between victim-survivors, and despite evidence⁵ indicating a high incidence of violence (i.e. abusive clients, coercion and exploitation by brothel owners) these acts in practice do not get legal recognition and the police refuse to register FIRs.

- 3.2. Social stigma makes it easier to sexually assault people in sex work, judicial stigma means lower rape complaints, and near-zero convictions. Rape convictions for *all* women are anyway abysmally low in India. These rapes (barring those in marriage) are legally recognized as crimes, even when not redressed⁶ that is not the case of sexual assault on sex workers. As in the case of a 52-year-old woman in Mumbai who accused industrialist Abhishek Kasliwal of offering her a late night ride and then raping her in his car? Public and media sympathy stayed with her until it was known that she was a sex worker. Somehow, this reduced the severity of the charge in the minds of lawmakers; she became less of a 'good woman' in the eyes of the law.⁷
- 4. State Violence against sex workers

For sex workers, the State has become an instrument of violence, feared; rather than seen as protectors of rights. Sex workers fear to file complaints because of the fear of reprisals.

- 4.1 People in positions of authority routinely demand sexual favours from sex workers for releasing them from custody, speedy redress of grievance, accessing entitlements⁸. This should be considered within the purview of "Aggravated Sexual Assault".
- 4.2 Police routinely abuse sex workers, illegally detain, sexually assault and torture them in custody. Their rights when being arrested are routinely violated in blatant violation of the guidelines laid down by the National Human Rights Commission on arrest and custody.
- 4.3 People in authority regularly verbally abuse sex workers using specific sexual innuendo and language. This should be considered as sexual assault.
- 4.4 When sex workers approach the police to register cases of violence and assault by private parties; their right to remedies are routinely denied by the police who refuse to lodge First Information Reports or investigate the assaults.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Recognize all forms of sexual assault and violence against sex workers and pass directives for investigation and registering of FIRs and timely action against perpetrators.

2. Rules about arresting and detaining women at night should also strictly apply to transgender and women in sex work.

⁴ Kinnel, Hillary (2008): Violence and sex work in Britain. Devon: Willan Publishing.

⁵ The power to tackle violence: Avahan's experience with community led crisis response in India. 2009

⁶ Her body your gaze, prostitution, violence and ways of seeing, Bisakha Datta, Nine Degrees of Justice

⁷ ibid.

⁸ Pan India Survey of Sex Workers



3. Survivors of sexual assault should be offered the option of having a lawyer of their choice appointed as Special Public Prosecutor for the case.

4. Cases of sexual assault and violence should be speedily disposed through day to day hearing and trial.

5. Issue directives to facilitate sex workers to obtain restraining orders and other protective measures against perpetrators of violence (including State Actors).

6. Maintain confidentiality and respect the privacy of sex workers approaching law enforcement and judiciary for redress in cases of sexual assault, rape and violence.

7. Provide trained counsellors for survivors of sexual assault, rape and violence. Ensure specific skills and sensitivity in dealing with women, persons who identify as women and transgender women in sex work.

8. Sensitivity to violence faced by sex workers should be made an integral part of training for police personnel, public prosecutors and the judiciary in partnership with community organisations of sex workers.

9. Standard Operating Procedures with detailed guidelines on investigating violence and sexual assault should be developed through consultation with experts and women's groups, sex worker community organisations, activists and legal experts working with sex workers. This should include specific guidelines detailing procedures to investigate sexual assault and violence faced by women, persons who identify as women and transgender women in sex work.

10. Constitute a sexual assault State / District task force comprising of civil society representatives working on violence against women, police, state or district commission for women that monitors response to complaints, filing cases, filing charge sheets and its presentation in court in a timely manner.

Amend provisions of IPC and other laws

11. Amend Section 377 of the Indian Penal Code in accordance with the Delhi High Judgment in Naz Foundation vs. NCT of Delhi

12. Amend or repeal laws including provisions of Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act that criminalize consenting and adult sex work and related activities.

13. For amended Sections 375, 376, 376 A, B, C and D (Indian Penal Code) the perpetrator must remain gender specific

14. For the purposes of Sections 375, 376, 376 A, B, C and D; the definition of the victim be made gender neutral to extend protection to male, transsexual and transgender victims of sexual assault.

Sexual assault and armed conflict

15. In a situation of mass violence (caste, communal or armed conflict) various forms of sexual assault are perpetrated against women, persons who identify as women and transgender women and girls. Doctors working in such situations should therefore look for signs/evidence of sexual assault amongst all women, persons who identify as women and transgender women and girls who come to the hospital, whether they are brought dead or alive. Sexual Assault examination should be made a part of post mortems in situations of armed conflict and communal violence.

16. Health professionals must receive training on their ethical duties and neutral role in situations of armed conflict. The State must provide security to its health professionals under such circumstances so that they may be allowed to carry out their duties without fear or external pressure.

17. In instances where sexual violence is perpetrated by state actors, an independent committee of experts must be established to conduct medico-legal examinations and other investigations.

18. Treatment and psychosocial support to address the physical and mental health consequences of sexual violence should specially be made available in situations of armed conflict.

National Network Of Sex Workers – India Email-nationalnetworkofsexworkers@gmail.com



19. Pass directives to ensure that any action taken by the law enforcement against female, male and transgender people in sex work is in pursuance to and in strict compliance with the due process established by law

SIGNATORIES

- 1. Shabana Dastagir, General Secretary, VAMP, Maharashtra
- 2. Anantamma, President, Uttar Kannada Mahila Okkutu, Karnataka
- 3. Lalitha, President, Karnataka Sex Worker's Union, Karnataka
- 4. Meena Saraswathi Seshu, SANGRAM, Sangli, MH
- 5. E. Manohar, Sangama, Karnataka
- 6. Sanghmitra Iyyengar, Samraksha, Karnataka
- 7. Indumathi Ravishanakar, South India AIDS Action Program Tamil Nadu
- 8. Meera Raghavendra, WINS, Tirupathi, AP
- 9. Nalini Jameel, Kerala
- 10. Aarthi Pai, Advocate Bangalore
- 11. Rakesh Shukla, Advocate, Supreme Court Of India
- 12. Laxmi Murthy, Bangalore
- 13. Anjali Gopalan, Naz Foundation (India) Trust, Delhi
- 14. Sudhir Patil, General Secretary, MUSKAN, Maharashtra
- 15. Jeevan Jyothi Mahila Sangam, Chittoor, AP
- 16. Sree Sai Durga Maitree Mahila Sangam, AP

2 19171 22 2012 21027



Meena Jaramathi Jeshu











National Network Of Sex Workers – India Email-nationalnetworkofsexworkers@gmail.com



17.	Prashanthi mahila Sangam, prakasam, AP -	Sujatha, Lakshmi, Adilakshmi	
18.	Swetha Mahila Sangham, Prakasam, AP -	Sumalatha, Jyothy, Mariam, Venkayamma, Shankurathri kumari, Nageswari	
19.	Adharsha Mahila Sangham, Prakasam, AP - Suwarna, Prameela Rani, Reena		
20.	Pragathi Mahila Mandali, Prakasam, AP	Shilaja, Nagamani	
21.	Sangamithra Mahila Sanghshema Sangham,	Prakasam, AP -	Jayanthi, Seshamma, Sowmya
22.	Navachaithanya Mahila Mandali, Pileru, Chittoor, AP - Nagarathna, Pankajakshi Razhjhana		
23.	Prema sanghamMahila Mandali,Chittoor, AP - Thara, Eswari, Lakshmi		
24.	Adharsh Mahila Mandali, Gurramkonda, Chittoor, AP - Rani, Saradha, Bharathi		
25.	Sree Chaitanya Mahila sangham, Chittoor, A	AP -	Bhuvaneswari, Kalpana, Lalithamma
26.	Sreeshakthi Mahila Sangham, Srikalahasthi, Chittoor, AP -		Lakshmi Padmamma, Gowramma
27.	Mythili Mahila Mandali, Chittoor, AP	-	Rekha, Prasanna Lakshmi Raniamma
28.	Vasant Appasahib Bhonsale, Editor, Lokmat	, Kolhapur, MH -	Bhosale
29.	Bishakha Datta, Point of View, Mumbai, MH		

5 January 2013



Signatories

1. Jeeva, Transgender, President, V- CAN , Chennai, TN

2. Renuka, Women Development Society, Madurai

3. Mr. Stanely Jose, Saral AIDS Prevention Society , Thirunelveli

4. Mr. Suyambu, Kumari AIDS Prevention Society, Kanniyakumari

5. Jony Reegan Fernando Neithal AIDS Prevention Society Tuticorin

- 6. Mahendraselvan CARE Dindugal
- 7. Maharani Reega Foundation Sivagangai
- 8. Sudha Vadamalar Sangam Tuticorin

9. Bharathikannamma TG Bharathikannamma Trust Madurai

K. Creye Laboration WE-Community Action Network (VCAN)

7/3, Chinnaiah New Colony, IInd Main Road, Perambur, Chennai – 600 011 Ph: 044-42858584 / Email: <u>mail@vcannetwork.net</u>

JrRenuble

C. A.b. 1



A.M.



P. Maha 3. Sudha





- 10. Gajalakshmi Snegidham Women Trust Trichy
- 11. Dhanaplan Valamuri Nalvazhvu Welfare Society Tuticorin S ちの リハのの
- 12. Vijayalakshmi Pengal Munmadiri Munnetra Sangam Cuddalore SVIJA YALAKSVI
- 13. Esakiamma Peace Trust Thirunelveli
- 14. Jayashanker Udhayam social welfare organisation Pudukottai
- 15. Selvam Krishnagiri AIDS Prevention Society Krishnagiri A-

Asoonelee

- 16. Sonalee TG CAN Trichy
- 17. Viji Anbu Trust Turicorin V. V
- 18. Kannadassan Minnal AIDS Prevention Society Cuddalore
- 19. Lakshmi Leaf Foundation Thiruvallur NLakshm; 20. Boomika TG. Chimava Trust Virudhungger 8. Bhorista
- 20. Boomika TG, Chimaya Trust Virudhunagar

5th January 2013 **Tamil Nadu**

Sahabhagini - State Level Federation of Women in Sex Work Collectives – Karnataka

We, the members of Sahabhagini - State Level Federation of Women in Sex Work Collectives – Karnataka endorse the submission made by National Network of Sex Workers [NNSW] India to THE JUSTICE VERMA COMMITTEE

Signatories

- 1. Gangavva Teli, President, Sahabhagini Federation Karnataka
- 2. Shanthamma, Secretary, Sahabhagini Federation (Mandya District)
- 3. Renukamma, Board Member, Sahabhagini Federation (Chitraduraga District)
- 4. Manjula, Treasurer, Sahabhagini Federation (Mysore District)

5 January2013

Karnataka



HB Marshen



Signatures in support of

Recommendations on Laws Relating to Sexual Assault in India

SUBMISSION TO THE JUSTICE VERMA COMMITTEE

CBOs from Andhra Pradesh, India - (CBOs promoted by HLFPPT, Swagathi program)

Shahanaz – President, Siri mahila Sadhikarika welfare society (CBO), Guntur
SK Shahang

2. SK Reshma, Para legal volunteer from CBO, Guntur

- 3. Annamani, BOD member and para legal volunteer from CBO, Guntur
- 4. A.Kamallama, Joint secretary (CBO), Guntur * A まいのい
- 5. Y.Chendra Kumari, Secretary (CBO), Guntur * Y. Chandra Kumari
- 6. Ch.Swarna Latha, Para legal volunteer from CBO, Guntur
- 7. Sangeetha, Secretary, Swecha Mahila Abhudaya sangam CBO, W.Godavari $* \kappa \cdot \sim \circ R \cdot c$
- 8. D. Kumari, Para legal Volunteer from CBO, W.Godavari * Bokorov

9. P. Swarna Kumari, Para legal Volunteer from CBO, W.Godavari

10. Damayathi, Secretary of Swagati mahila sangam CBO, Srikakulam

11. P.Saraswathi, Para legal Volunteer from CBO, Srikakulam

12. Ramanamma, Para legal Volunteer from CBO, Srikakulam * Assunisy)

We the community of women in sex work from Manipur and Nagaland endorse the submission made by National Network of Sex Workers (India) and call on the Commission to please give special emphasis to the abuse and violence faced by women in sex work in conflict

1. Ms. M. C. Reeta Meetei Leimarol Senai Sang (MLSS), Manipur

 Ms. Avi Asha (community-based group of sex workers), Dimapur District, Nagaland

The following represent **Home Sweet Home** (Community-managed night shelter for sex workers in Imphal West district)

- 3. Ms. Heting, Senapati District, Manipur
- 4. Ms. Sangeets, Imphal West District, Manipur
- 5. Ms. Kimboi, Chandel District, Manipur

Songeta

Kimboi

Greeta

A

- 6. Ms. Geeta, Imphal West District, Manipur
- 7. Ms. Maibam Jenny, Imphal West District, Manipur
- 8. Ms. Maibam Sundari, Imphal West District, Manipur
- 9. Ms. Hennah, Chandel District, Manipur
- 10. Ms. Kim Paite, Churachandpur District, Manipur

5 January 2013 Manipur, Nagaland

M. Sundari beri

Hennah

kim

CBO Members from Chittor, Ananthopus Malgarda SC-NO al g. SOUSTE NiBamabad Adilabad Karimnapar khaman 6080 K. Gozo Asanthapere K.obulama 2. Woronyal P.S. Raynai David 3 . P.S. Lag Dev." K. Natamani Le K. JAL S W. Mahaleks2M, 5. aust elig 6. 55027 P. Varaeukshmi 7. P. 27 25 p.shobhq 8. 62100 622 9. 0105 MRadhika waves 10 . Brease of 11. K- NONOF K. Loto 12. B-2708ar 13. p.370 B-380 8209 121. P 200 200 \$-38° 03 15 vere 16 · Sabe RSase 17 4005 Plaima 18 form NUN orady 19 Elat N. Dord 305hale 20 Bassérant 21 LONZ 22 6 and Toorsoy 23 Aco B. an Fly 24 N. Winges N.S. DIME E. USA EUSTO 25 P. Pushpa Latha Nº Sulatha 26 P. Jushpa Latha Radha 27 OPR 28 6000 SOUCE premeter R. Prometa 29

2.0000000 30 31 11 32 11 33 11 34 11 35 11 36 11 37 11 38 11 OF Ju 29 Statey 40. DA Jun 4 D Pr Jon 42 03 Clock 44 () arw 105 SEdand SK. KnatnijaBe 46 L. Kovenie phanna Le7 p-Sandlugar khammam U8 kho man nd. 50 khannam 51 phannam

28 D.00250 M. EShwasai M. 2023 05 M. 000 5 D. 3025 G1. 6 6 Su Edaly · 202005. 25025 636 YNEGOW 7 2 2 ar e. S. KÃORO DO P E. 250 5. 2 2000 241. 211 21 9/1 3000 2006 (0. 9701877154 whammans h. hasenil Sandhya. 20 Sindhu Rama Deri usha

NESSO 00000000 M. EShuasaj 17. 20 250 65 D 2025 6 02 03 0 de y 2600 a Taliales Knop 20 B E Por Salater सा. गरावरा 55,52 上的影力 Sennlye 20 Serellu 8.S. 2.0 rato

J JU Shove NESTA nº, er P. Julita P. Jalita C. T.R ALaKShi ALakshi -Jelex

30 K. Shandha Kharla, 31 T. Road T. a Gar